

Celebrating
60
years

**Land Formerly Known as British
Gas Works, Albert Road, New
Barnet, EN4 9BH**

**Appendices to Proof of Evidence of
Simon Slatford**

Appellant: Citystyle Fairview VQ LLP

Planning Inspectorate No: APP/N5090/W/22/3294689

Application No: 21/3676/FUL

21 June 2022

LICHFIELDS

Contents

Appendix A: Response to other objections/concerns about the appeal scheme	1
Appendix B: Economic Benefits of the Appeal Scheme	2

Appendix A: Response to other objections/concerns about the appeal scheme

Appendix A: Proof of Evidence of Simon Slatford

Land Formerly Known as British Gas Works, Albert Road, New Barnet, EN4 9BH

Appellant: Citystyle Fairview VQ LLP

Planning Inspectorate No: APP/N5090/W/22/3294689

Other Matters Raised by Rule 6 Party and in Representations

This note sets out the appellant's response to a number of areas of concern that have been raised by the Rule 6 Party in the SoC, but which are not covered under the 'Main Issues' identified by the Inspector in the CMC Note.

Representations submitted on the appeal by local residents have also been reviewed and it is considered that these have all been covered either in the proofs of evidence or under the matters set out below.

Contamination:

- 1.1 In the Statement of Case the Rule 6 Party states, at paragraph 5.3, that there are serious concerns about the adequacy of the remediation of the site and impact on residents, particularly those in Block E (all social housing) where the lack of a hydrocarbon barrier under part of the block may allow hydrocarbon vapours to enter the building.
- 1.2 In response the Council's EHO Team advised that 'I have read CGL Supplementary Geoenvironmental Interpretative Report and Revised Remediation Strategy REV 2 dated June 2021. The site has been largely been remediated well by J F Hunt, but some additional remediation is still required. Therefore, I would recommend the condition below:

Remediation works as detailed in the CGL Geoenvironmental Interpretative Report and Revised Remediation Strategy, Rev 2, dated June 2021 shall be carried out and upon completing of the remediation a report that provides verification that the required works have been carried out, shall be submitted to, and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before the development is occupied

Reason: To ensure the development can be implemented and occupied with adequate regard for environmental and public safety in accordance with Policy CS NPPF of the Local Plan Core Strategy DPD (adopted September 2012), DM04 of the Development Management Policies DPD (adopted September 2012), the Sustainable Design and Construction SPD (adopted October 2016) and 5.21 of the London Plan 2016.

Dwelling Mix

- 1.3 In paragraph 6.2 of the Rule 6 Party Statement of Case it is stated that in the extant scheme there were 30% 3 and 4 bedroom homes reflecting the need for larger family housing as set out in the Council's Strategic Housing Market Assessment. "The appellant's scheme has only 22% 3 and 4 bedroom homes and just 11.7% of market homes in the scheme are 3 bedrooms (no 4 bedroom market homes) even though 3 and 4 bedroom homes are the top priority as set out in Barnet's current policies DMO8 and CS4, draft policy HOU02".
- 1.4 However, this is not a matter raised by either the GLA or the Council. In paragraph 36 of the Stage 1 Report (**CD**) the GLA merely state that "In line with Policy H10, the units size mix should be agreed with the Council to meet local housing need".
- 1.5 In the Committee Report (**CD**), at paragraphs 3.2.4 and 3.2.4, it is stated that:
"Given the application site's edge of town centre location and urban character, it is considered that the proposed mix is acceptable and consistent with the highlighted policy approach. Indeed, half of the overall number of proposed units are large two-bed, or three-bed units, with 111 of these provided as affordable housing units.
Overall, it is considered that the proposed scheme comprises a good mix of housing types and sizes to address the housing preference and need. Officers therefore consider the proposed dwelling mix to be acceptable and in accordance with Policy DMO8 of the Local Plan".
- 1.6 The underlining is my emphasis, to highlight that the Council rightly had regard to a number of considerations and also considered housing preference and need, which is not a site specific matter but a Borough wide one, when considering compliance with the Policy.

Inaccuracies (as raised by Rule 6 Party):

- 1.7 In paragraph 6.3 of the Statement of Case, it is stated that the applicant has provided supporting data that is inaccurate, out of date and misleading. These are listed below with the appellant's response.
1. Misleading number of car parking spaces on East Barnet Road by including the road under the railway bridge to the junction with Lytton Road where, although it is single yellow line, a car parked there would gridlock the traffic. On Tewkesbury Close it states there are 9 places when in fact there are none as this is the entrance to Sainsburys car park (Transport Assessment Report).

Response: This is addressed in the proof of evidence of Mr Dix.

2. The applicant also includes an email from a council officer that appears to endorse a key element of the design. However, the element the officer endorses does not exist in the current scheme, but was in the 2020 scheme. The Circular Economy Statement also includes references to this non-existent element of the scheme.

Response: I believe this is referring to the kiosk that was proposed on the 2020 scheme. The kiosk performed a placemaking function in the 2020 scheme, when the buildings were intentionally close knit. In the appeal scheme, Block A is redesigned to improve the pedestrian environment, make the community more pronounced next to the Park Plaza and the cut out square space that was better linked to the public area, and prioritised opened up spaces more within this scheme. It was subsequently determined that the kiosk did not perform as successfully as it did previously.

3. Misleading claims about the extant scheme implying there are a large number of North facing flats when in reality there are only 16 single aspect North facing flats or just 4.3% of the 371 flats.

Response: The issue regarding single aspect north facing flats in the appeal scheme is addressed by Mr Pullan and in my proof.

4. Stating that Kingmaker House development, approximately 220 metres from the appellant scheme, comprises of 43 flats and “will have a marginal impact on the social infrastructure in the area” when, in fact, the scheme comprises 137 flats.

Response: Planning application reference:19/5403/FUL was for the extension of Kingmaker House at roof level of two storeys to the front and part 5 and 9 to the rear to create 45 new residential units including extension to the permitted development units. There were permitted development units approved prior to this.

5. The applicant has had more than two years to prepare a design for the ramp connecting the new ground level public right of way to the pedestrian tunnel under the railway line. They did not provide details for the 2020 application and they have still not provided it in this 2021 application, a concern raised by the GLA in their pre-app advice (paragraph 46) of 7 June 2021

Response: The ramp detail is included within the legal agreement of the extant permission. Dealing with Network Rail is very complicated, so until we are in a position to further set up timings detailed design and agreements there is no requirement to progress the ramp scheme further than has already been approved. The ramp information is included within the appellants response (CD) to response to the GLA Stage 1 Report (CD).

Appendix B: Economic Benefits of the Appeal Scheme

Briefing Note

Our ref 64025/01/SSL/CGJ/SPz

Date 30 May 2022

Subject Victoria Quarter, New Barnet, EN4 9BH - Economic and Social Benefits

1.0 Introduction

- 1.1 This briefing note has been prepared by Lichfields to present the potential economic and social benefits associated with the proposed development at Victoria Quarter, Albert Road, New Barnet, EN4 9BH (the ‘proposed development’) in the London Borough of Barnet (LBB).
- 1.2 The description of the proposed development (ref. 21/3676/FUL) comprises:
- “Redevelopment of the site to provide 539 residential units (Use Class C3) within 13 buildings ranging from 4 to 7 storeys, with 267.1sqm of retail/commercial space and 112.7sqm of community space (Use Class E and F) at ground floor, new public realm with communal landscaped amenity areas, alterations and additions to existing highways arrangements plus the removal of existing elevated footbridge and creation of new pedestrian routes, 334 car parking spaces (including car club and accessible provision) with basement and surface level provision, secure cycle parking, servicing and other associated development”*
- 1.3 The following paragraphs provide an overview of the methodological approach and key assumptions that underpin the assessment of the benefits relating to the proposed development. The analysis draws primarily on the [Evaluate](#) framework developed by Lichfields, which provides an analytical framework for assessing the economic benefits arising from new development. Evaluate is regularly used by local authorities to assess the economic impact of developments in their area, as well as many of the UK’s leading developers, investors and house builders.

2.0 Construction Stage Impacts

Direct Employment

- 2.1 The construction cost of the proposed development is estimated to be around £93.7 million¹. Using labour coefficients from the Homes and Communities Agency (HCA) Calculating Cost per Job Best Practice Note (2015)², it is possible to estimate the number of direct construction jobs that could be supported by the proposed development over the course of the construction phase. Taking account of the composition of the proposed

¹ Construction costs agreed between the Appellant and Barnet Council

² Homes and Communities Agency (HCA), (2015); Calculating Cost per Job Practice Note

development, the coefficient for the development of ‘new housing’ is considered the most appropriate for calculating the number of direct construction jobs. This coefficient assumes that 19.9 years of Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) employment would be generated per £1 million of construction cost in 2011 prices.

- 2.2 To use the coefficient, the construction cost of £93.7 million has been deflated to 2011 prices using the UK Government GDP Deflator (2021)³, resulting in a construction cost of £77.1 million. Applying the ‘new housing’ coefficient to the deflated construction cost and then dividing the result by the length of the construction phase (i.e. 59 months) suggests that the proposed development could support **313 direct FTE jobs annually** over the construction phase. As construction is made up of many discrete elements of work undertaken by specialists (e.g. bricklaying, carpentry, plumbing, electrics etc.), the number of workers on site will inevitably fluctuate during different periods of the construction phase.

Indirect and Induced Employment

- 2.3 Housing construction involves purchases from a range of suppliers who in turn purchase from their own suppliers via the supply chain. The relationships between the initial direct spending and total economic impacts are known as the ‘multiplier effect’, which demonstrates that an initial investment can have much larger economic benefits as this expenditure is diffused through the economy. Local businesses across Barnet and North London more widely could benefit from trade connections established during the construction phase of the proposed development. As a result, further indirect jobs would be supported locally within the economy through the suppliers of construction materials and equipment.
- 2.4 In addition, local businesses would also be expected to benefit to some extent from temporary growth in expenditure linked to the direct and indirect employment effects of the construction phase. While only a portion of these benefits would be felt in the local area, it would be anticipated that the local economy could benefit from a temporary boost from the wage spending of workers within shops, bars and restaurants, and other service facilities in New Barnet. Such effects are typically referred to as ‘induced effects’.
- 2.5 Research undertaken on behalf of the National Housing Federation indicates that the construction industry has an indirect and induced employment multiplier of 1.99⁴. Applying this employment multiplier to the 313 direct FTE construction jobs per year derived above indicates that an additional **310 FTE indirect and induced jobs** could be supported per year of construction by the proposed development in sectors throughout the UK economy. This is in addition to the 313 FTE direct jobs noted above.

Economic Output (Gross Value Added)

- 2.6 The construction phase of the proposed development will also make a significant contribution by generating additional Gross Value Added (GVA). GVA is a measure of the

³ UK Government, (2021); GDP Deflator

⁴ Indirect and Induced employment has been calculated using an employment multiplier of 1.99 sourced from the National Housing Federation (2019). This implies that per direct job generated, a further 0.99 induced jobs are supported in the supply chain.

difference between what is produced as an output (goods and services) and the inputs (such as raw materials and semi-finished products) used in the production of the output. It represents the additional value that is added through economic activity.

- 2.7 Based on 2021 Experian data⁵, it is estimated that the construction phase of the proposed development could generate **£32.1 million of direct GVA** and **£36.9 million of indirect and induced GVA** during each year of construction⁶. This equates to around £68.9 million direct, indirect and induced GVA in total per annum. It should be noted that not all of this will be retained locally.

3.0 Operational Stage Impacts

Direct Employment

- 3.1 The proposed development includes the delivery of new employment floorspace, which is estimated to total 276.1 sq.m. of retail/commercial space. By applying typical employment densities⁷ from the latest Homes and Communities Agency (HCA) Employment Densities Guide (2015), it is estimated that the proposed development, once complete and operational, could support approximately **18 direct workforce jobs**, equivalent to **12 Full Time Equivalent (FTE) direct jobs**⁸.

Indirect and Induced Employment

- 3.2 Indirect jobs will be supported by the commercial floorspace as a result of additional spending amongst business occupiers on goods, supplies and services in the surrounding area. The spending of wages by the additional employees of the commercial space once complete and operational is also expected to support induced employment in other local shops, services and firms.
- 3.3 Using composite multipliers from the HCA's Additionality Guide (2014) of 1.21 and 1.38 for the local and regional levels, it is possible to estimate the number of indirect and induced jobs that could be supported by the proposed development⁹.
- 3.4 By applying these multipliers to the 12 direct FTE jobs, the proposed development is estimated to support a further **3 FTE indirect and induced jobs at the local level**, and **5 FTE indirect and induced jobs at the regional level**.

Economic Output (Gross Value Added)

- 3.5 The operational phase of the proposed development will also make a significant contribution to local economic output (GVA) through the creation of these new jobs. Using GVA per worker proxy values from Experian¹⁰, it is estimated that the 12 FTE direct jobs

⁵ Experian, (March 2021); Gross Value Added

⁶ Indirect and induced GVA has been calculated using a GVA multiplier of 2.15 sourced from the National Housing Federation (2019).

⁷ An employment density of 14.5 sq.m GEA per Job was used to calculate direct workforce jobs and an employment density of 22 sq.m GEA per Job for FTE direct job were used in line with HCA Employment Guidance for retail employment floorspace.

⁸ Homes and Communities (HCA), Employment Densities Guide, (2015)

⁹ HCA, Additionality Guide, (2014)

¹⁰ Experian, Gross Value Added per Worker, (2021)

created could generate **£662,000 of direct FTE GVA per annum** once the commercial floorspace is operational.

4.0 Expenditure Impacts

‘First Occupation’ Expenditure

- 4.1 Research suggests that the average homeowner, when moving into a new dwelling, spends approximately £5,500 to make their house ‘feel like home’¹¹. This money is generally spent on furnishing and decorating a property, which will generate a range of economic benefits including further indirect and induced jobs in local businesses.
- 4.2 By applying this average value of one-off spending on household products and services, it is estimated that the new residents of the 539 dwellings could generate **£3.0 million of ‘first occupation’ expenditure**. This injection of resident spending within the local economy will help to support local businesses.

Ongoing Resident Expenditure

- 4.3 An analysis of ‘Output Area Classifications’ data indicates that the neighbourhoods surrounding the proposed development are largely occupied by households in the ‘multicultural metropolitans’ socio-economic classification group¹². The population of this group is predominantly located within denser central areas of London, where ethnic groups such as Black, Asian and/or Mixed Ethnicity (‘BAME’) have (in aggregate) a higher representation than the UK average.
- 4.4 Residents of this socio-economic group are more likely to be below retirement age, with a high proportion of households having children who attend school or college, or who are currently too young to do so. Given this, and other local characteristics, it is therefore assumed that the new households accommodated within the market homes of the proposed development would broadly fall within the same type of household group.
- 4.5 The ONS Family Spending Survey (2020 edition) provides data on average household spending by socio-economic classification group¹³. This indicates that the average ‘multicultural metropolitans’ household spends £571.4 per week. It also indicates that the average London household spends 20% higher than the UK equivalent. Assuming that the population of the proposed development will broadly reflect these socio-economic characteristics, it is estimated that average household expenditure of those living in the market homes of the proposed development could be equivalent to £685.5 per week.
- 4.6 It is assumed that households living within the 149 affordable units in the proposed development will broadly match the ONS ‘hard-pressed living’ socio-economic group. Based on data from the latest ONS Family Spending Survey, it is estimated that weekly

¹¹ Research carried out by OnePoll surveying around 2,000 UK adults in August 2014: <https://www.barratthomes.co.uk/the-buying-process/home-buying-advice/>

¹² ONS, (2011); Area Classification for Output Areas

¹³ ONS, (2020); ONS Family Spending Survey

expenditure by households within the ‘hard-pressed living’ socio-economic group amounts to £555.8 per week in London.

- 4.7 As a result, it is estimated that the residents of the proposed development could generate **total gross expenditure of around £18.2m per annum** once the proposed development is fully occupied.

Net Resident Expenditure

- 4.8 It is recognised that not all residents of the proposed development will be ‘new’ to the local area, as some will move from elsewhere in Barnet and beyond. National research provides standards on the average distance moved between a head of the household’s present and previous residential address, which can be used to estimate the share of residents of the scheme that may be genuinely new to the locality¹⁴.
- 4.9 In addition, only a proportion of the gross expenditure will be retained in the local area. Based on analysis of the Council’s latest [retail evidence](#)¹⁵ supported by survey undertaken within Barnet on retained expenditure and turnover of comparison and convenience goods, it is estimated that 40% of spending on goods and services will be retained within the retail study area where the proposed development is located.
- 4.10 Taking these factors into account, it is estimated that residents of the proposed development could generate **£5.0 million of net additional expenditure per annum** within Barnet. This additional spending will support the vitality and viability of local firms and could encourage other businesses to move to the local market as well as supporting the function of local centres. Moreover, it is estimated that this additional expenditure could support a further **35 FTE jobs** in retail, leisure, hospitality, catering and other local service sectors.

5.0 Fiscal Impacts

Council Tax Payments

- 5.1 The proposed development will generate an increase in Council Tax receipts, providing an additional boost to the revenue base of the Borough. Drawing upon the local Council Tax charges payable for 2022/23¹⁶, it is estimated that the proposed development could generate around **£750,000 per annum in additional Council Tax payments** in perpetuity.

Business Rates

- 5.2 The proposed development will also generate business rates receipts through the delivery of new employment floorspace. This will provide the London Borough of Barnet and the Greater London Authority with revenue through the UK Government’s business rates

¹⁴ DTLR, (2016); Survey of English Housing, Tenure by Distance Moved

¹⁵ PBA, (2017) London Borough of Barnet, Town Centres Floorspace Needs Assessment

¹⁶ Barnet Council (2022); Council Tax Bands 2022/23

retention scheme, helping to fund local services and support investment in important local and wider infrastructure.

- 5.3 Drawing upon existing VOA rateable values for comparable commercial space in proximity to the site and the latest national business rate multipliers, it is estimated that the proposed development could generate approximately **£23,000 per annum in Business Rates payments.**

6.0 Social Benefits

Impacts on Deprivation

- 6.1 The neighbourhood surrounding the site¹⁷ experiences high levels of deprivation based on the latest data from IMD¹⁸ ranking amongst the 30% most deprived neighbourhoods with particularly high scoring in relation to income, barriers to housing, income deprivation affecting children and elderly population and the living environment.
- 6.2 On this basis, the households around the proposed development appears to be in low-income or unemployment, have issues in accessing housing due to affordability constraints and the quality of the local environment reflecting mainly the quality of the existing housing stock. These issues do not only affect the wider community; but, also, vulnerable groups such as children and the elderly.
- 6.3 Considering the above, the proposed development will increase the housing supply and housing choice for the local population alongside providing new high-quality homes that the area appears to require. Moreover, it will provide an additional 149 affordable homes easing the affordability pressures that are currently high across the area based on the housing deprivation sub domain.
- 6.4 Furthermore, the proposed development will create job opportunities during both the construction and operation phase for a variety of skill levels from elementary to managerial.
- 6.5 Synthesising the above, it is expected that the proposed development will have a significant contribution in easing local deprivation, supporting local population's wellbeing and enhancing the quality of living for its new occupiers.

Impacts on Housing

- 6.6 The proposed development will boost the Borough's housing delivery and assist in meeting the London Plan's annual requirement of 2,364 dwellings per annum by providing a total of 539 new homes (or 23% of the annual requirement or 2.3% of the ten-year requirement), of which 149 will be affordable. It should be also noted that the proposed development will contribute in dealing with the large-scale challenge that London faces in meeting future housing need.

¹⁷ Barnet 006B Lower Super Output Area, available at https://dclgapps.communities.gov.uk/imd/iod_index.html#

¹⁸ Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government (2019) Indices of Deprivation

- 6.7 A range of housing tenures will be built including a total of 149 affordable homes comprising 77 London affordable rent homes and 72 homes for shared ownership. These represent 35% of habitable rooms provided across the proposed development.
- 6.8 The proposed development will, therefore, assist in easing affordability pressures across the local housing market, and by enhancing the overall supply. If these affordability issues are not addressed, there is risk that local residents are forced to move further afield, increasing commuting, and reducing the local labour supply. This could limit the prospects for local businesses to create and/or maintain the current level of employment in the area.

Impacts on Residents' Wellbeing

- 6.9 The proposed development offers an opportunity to put in place buildings which fit cohesively with the surrounding urban area, enriching the overall quality of the built environment and the local public realm. These improvements include the provision of cycle parking spaces alongside public realm improvements to promote the use of active travel. As part of the development, Albert Road West and Albert Road East will be reimaged to improve the public realm and enhance facilities for people walking and cycling along its length. This will ensure wider connectivity throughout the site and enhance the safety of pedestrian and cycle movement on-site.
- 6.10 In total, 334 car parking spaces will be provided on-site, including car clubs. The development is a less than 5-minute walk from the station (within PTAL 3¹⁹) and aims to maximise the use of public transport and more sustainable travel modes, including cycling and walking. These can encourage active lifestyles, boost health, contribute to better air quality for the local environment and overall enhance the resident's wellbeing.
- 6.11 The scheme will also provide over 1,700 sq.m of public open space on site and 5,200 sq.m of communal amenity space, and 5,600 sq.m of private amenity space in the form of terraces and balconies. Both the children's play space and the communal amenity space will contribute positively to the health and well-being of residents. Accessible open spaces and play spaces can encourage physical activity, maintain or improve mental health, and provide social interaction amongst new and existing residents to avoid isolation, particularly for vulnerable people.
- 6.12 In addition, a community hub of 113 sq.m will be provided to enhance community participation and provide space where residents can gather, talk, celebrate and in general be together. These activities help people to be more social, deal with loneliness and proactively support mental health issues.
- 6.13 Finally, the proposed development will also provide a community allotment as part of the wider proposal, which will contribute to opportunities for food growing and improved food choices, which could encourage healthy diet, address health issues associated with unhealthy eating, such as obesity, but also support people with mental health issues as

¹⁹ PTAL is a measure which rates locations by distance from frequent public transport services. PTAL 3 relates to a well-connected area with high respectively accessibility served by high-frequency buses and rail.

gardening is therapeutic for mental health issues²⁰. Community allotments can also provide opportunities for social interaction with neighbours resulting in positive health outcomes.

7.0 Summary

7.1 As presented in this briefing note, the proposed development will have significant economic and social benefits for the local residents and the surrounding community. These include:

- 1 The generation of significant economic benefits during construction and, in particular:
 - a 313 direct FTE construction jobs per annum;
 - b 310 FTE indirect and induced jobs per annum;
 - c £32.1 million of direct GVA; and
 - d £36.9 million of indirect and induced GVA.
- 2 Significant economic benefits during the operation, including:
 - a 12 direct FTE jobs;
 - b 3 FTE indirect and induced jobs at the local level, and 5 FTE indirect and induced jobs at the regional level;
 - c £662,000 of direct FTE GVA per annum;
 - d £3.0 million of 'first occupation' expenditure; and
 - e £18.2m total gross expenditure per annum and £5.0 million of net additional expenditure per annum which could support a further 35 FTE jobs locally.
- 3 Contribution in local authority's revenues, including:
 - a £750,000 per annum in additional Council Tax payments; and
 - b £23,000 per annum in Business Rates payments.
- 4 Social benefits, such as:
 - a easing local deprivation, supporting local population's wellbeing and enhancing the quality of living for its new occupiers;
 - b increasing housing choice and supporting dealing with affordability issues; and
 - c encouraging active lifestyle for all ages;
 - d support social interaction and enhance community participation;
 - e encourage healthy eating; and
 - f providing activities that could support mental health issues.

²⁰ Page, M. (2008) Gardening as a therapeutic intervention in mental health. Nursing Times; 104: 45, 28–30.

Birmingham
0121 713 1530
birmingham@lichfields.uk

Edinburgh
0131 285 0670
edinburgh@lichfields.uk

Manchester
0161 837 6130
manchester@lichfields.uk

Bristol
0117 403 1980
bristol@lichfields.uk

Leeds
0113 397 1397
leeds@lichfields.uk

Newcastle
0191 261 5685
newcastle@lichfields.uk

Cardiff
029 2043 5880
cardiff@lichfields.uk

London
020 7837 4477
london@lichfields.uk

Thames Valley
0118 334 1920
thamesvalley@lichfields.uk



lichfields.uk